

Technological University Dublin [ARROW@TU Dublin](https://arrow.tudublin.ie/)

[Articles](https://arrow.tudublin.ie/otpomart)

2011

Macular Pigment: Its Associations with Color Discrimination and Matching

Peter Davison Technological University Dublin, Peter.Davison@tudublin.ie

Akkali Makunda Waterford Institute of Technology

James Loughman Technological University Dublin, james.loughman@tudublin.ie

See next page for additional authors

Follow this and additional works at: [https://arrow.tudublin.ie/otpomart](https://arrow.tudublin.ie/otpomart?utm_source=arrow.tudublin.ie%2Fotpomart%2F29&utm_medium=PDF&utm_campaign=PDFCoverPages)

C Part of the Medicine and Health Sciences Commons

Recommended Citation

Davison, P., Makunda, A., Loughman, J., Scanlon, G., Nolan,J., Beatty, S.,'' Macular Pigment: Its Associations with Color Discrimination and Matching'', Optometry & Vision Science, 88 (7), pp. 816-822. doi:10.1097/OPX.0b013e31821798ec

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by ARROW@TU Dublin. It has been accepted for inclusion in Articles by an authorized administrator of ARROW@TU Dublin. For more information, please contact [arrow.admin@tudublin.ie, aisling.coyne@tudublin.ie, vera.kilshaw@tudublin.ie](mailto:arrow.admin@tudublin.ie,%20aisling.coyne@tudublin.ie,%20vera.kilshaw@tudublin.ie).

Funder: Bausch & Lomb

Authors

Peter Davison, Akkali Makunda, James Loughman, Grainne Scanlon, John Nolan, and Stephen Beatty

Macular Pigment: its Associations with Color Discrimination and Matching

Peter Davison^{*}, Mukunda Akkali[†], James Loughman[‡], Grainne Scanlon[§], John Nolan[¶], Stephen Beatty⁺

 * MSc, PhD, † BS(Optom), ‡ PhD, FAOI, $^{\$}$ FAOI, $^{\$}$ BSc, PhD, * MD, FRCOphth

Macular Pigment Research Group (MPRG), Department of Optometry, Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland (PAD, JL, GS), and MPRG, Waterford Institute of Technology, Ireland (JN, SB)

1 table, 5 figures

Address for correspondence: Dr Peter A. Davison, National Optometry Centre, Dublin Institute of Technology, Kevin St., Dublin 8, Ireland (peter.davison@dit.ie), fax +353 1 402 2857

Submitted May 18th, 2010. Re-submitted November 4th, 2010.

Macular Pigment: its Associations with Color Discrimination and Matching [Davison et al.] 1 2

3

4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 Macular pigment (MP), consisting of the carotenoids lutein, zeaxanthin and meso-zeaxanthin, is concentrated at the macula and is not detectable optically beyond about 7 degrees from the foveal center 1 . Of these carotenoids, the zeaxanthins predominate at the fovea whereas lutein dominates beyond the fovea 2 . The extent of macular pigmentation has recently been found to be related to the width of the foveal cup, as assessed by optical coherence tomography ³. Since these pigments are located in the fibers of Henle at the foveola and in the inner nuclear layer beyond the foveola 4 , they act as a prereceptoral filter and are believed to contribute a variety of potentially beneficial properties for vision, including reduction of the effects of chromatic aberration ⁵ (though not supported by Engles et al. $⁶$), improvement of spatial vision and</sup> contrast enhancement 7 , increased photopic increment sensitivity 8 , reduced glare sensitivity in some studies $9,10$ but not others 11 , and increased critical flicker frequency¹².

18

19 20 21 22 23 Hue discrimination and color vision in general are most acute at the fovea ¹³ corresponding to increased cone density, specialized anatomic relationships and minimal spatial summation in this region (although with appropriate stimulus size scaling, surprisingly good color vision is possible beyond the fovea¹⁴). It is plausible that color discrimination at a small angular subtense would be

influenced by the optical density of MP at the fovea. Indeed it has long been speculated that inter-observer differences in color matching by color-normal observers are at least partially due to differences in macular pigmentation ^{15, 16}. Also it is known that even subjects with ophthalmoscopically-normal fundi exhibit substantial variations in MP optical density (MPOD), contributing to a range of prereceptoral light absorption at 460 nm from 3% to almost 100% ¹⁷. Dietary supplementation with the macular carotenoids has been shown to increase MPOD¹⁸ and may retard development of age-related macular degeneration (AMD) because of its antioxidant and short wavelength light filtering properties. Such hypotheses are currently the subject of a major randomized controlled clinical study (AREDS $2)^{19}$ and follows potentially significant results from the LAST2 study 20 . 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35

36

37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 Since the MP absorption spectrum ranges from about 400 to 520 nm and peaks at 460 nm 21 , it would seem likely that these pigments influence color vision through selective absorption of short wavelengths, thereby influencing the shortwave sensitive (SWS) cones and the blue-yellow opponent-color channel. Moreland and Dain²² (1995) reported that hue discrimination, measured using the Farnsworth-Munsell 100-Hue test (FM100), is indeed adversely affected primarily for short wavelengths by simulation of high MPOD using liquid filters containing carotene in a benzene solution. Comparing the results with those obtained with a neutral filter, they concluded that this effect was not simply the result of reduced retinal illuminance. However, to our knowledge there are no

published studies on the effects of actual (rather than simulated) MPOD on conventional measurements of hue discrimination thresholds. Further evidence supporting an effect of MPOD on short wavelength vision has been obtained from studies of SWS cone sensitivity $8, 23$. Finally, it has been shown that color discrimination measured by a color matching technique is influenced by MPOD 24, 25. 47 48 49 50 51 52

53

54 55 56 57 58 59 60 61 62 63 64 65 66 67 68 69 However, two recent studies using alternative methods, produced conclusions differing from those of the above mentioned studies. Firstly, a study of the effects of dietary supplementation with macular carotenoids on MP found no correlation between the level of MP (measured by heterochromatic flicker photometry) and red-green (RG) or yellow-blue (YB) color discrimination thresholds, though it was reported that RG vision tends to improve with augmentation of MP 26 . Secondly, RG cancellation profiles have been reported to be highly correlated with MPOD, while profiles for YB were independent of both eccentricity and MPOD $¹⁷$.</sup> However, changes in spectral sensitivity across the fovea, macula and paramacula are accompanied by relatively little change in color appearance, depending on whether corrections are made for macular pigment absorption $27,28$. Thus there is no consensus in the literature on the relationships, if any, between MPOD and color vision parameters on the one hand, and mechanisms on the other hand. This may or may not simply reflect the innate differences between, for example, spectral sensitivity measurements of the isolated SWS cone

mechanism and the overarching hue discrimination function at short wavelengths. It is also necessary to distinguish between the effects on color vision (mechanisms, sensitivity or appearance) of (1) distribution of macular pigment across the retina, and (2) variation of MPOD between subjects at a given retinal locus. 70 71 72 73 74

75

76 77 78 79 80 81 The objective of the present study was to evaluate, in a cross sectional manner, the associations between color variables and MPOD, using a much larger sample of subjects than in most previous studies and a battery of color assessments rather than relying on a single method of quantification. This study was part of a larger study of the association between MPOD and a wide range of vision parameters 11 .

82

83 The color vision tests used in the present study were (a) hue discrimination using

84 the FM100 test, (b) hue matching using the Moreland match on an

85 anomaloscope, and (c) short wavelength automated perimetry (SWAP)

86 increment thresholds using a customized procedure (cSWAP) to provide optimal

87 foveal and para-foveal stimuli.

88

89 The present study has clinical implications for the visual effects of dietary

90 supplementation of patients with AMD and at-risk patients.

91

92

93 **METHODS**

94

95 Identical instrumentation and test protocols were used in the Macular Pigment

96 Research Group laboratories in Dublin and Waterford, Ireland.

97

98 **Subjects**

99

100 102 healthy subjects aged 18 to 40 years and resident in either Dublin or

101 Waterford, Ireland, were recruited to participate in this dual-center study, which

102 was approved by Research Ethics Committees of Waterford Institute of

103 Technology and of Dublin Institute of Technology. Informed consent was

104 obtained from each volunteer, and the experimental procedures adhered to the

105 tenets of the Declaration of Helsinki.

106

107 Potential subjects underwent a full eye examination. The exclusion criteria

108 comprised: any ocular pathology (including abnormal macula appearance or

109 cataract); corrected visual acuity less than 6/9 in the better eye; refractive error

110 outside -6 to +6 diopters; defective color vision. One eye only of each subject

111 was tested, that with better corrected acuity. Full color vision data were available

112 for 84 subjects.

113

114 **Color Threshold/Sensitivity Techniques**

115

(a) The FM100 test (X-Rite UK, Poynton) was administered under color-corrected fluorescent lighting supplied by a pair of 15W 46 cm lamps (The Daylight Co., London, UK) providing minimum luminance of 94 cd. $m⁻²$ reflected from each color sample as measured with a spot telephotometer. Maximum background luminance reflected from the supplied black sample trays was 12 cd.m⁻². Color temperature is rated at $6400\degree$ K. Subjects were allowed to review the arrangement in each tray if they so requested. 116 117 118 119 120 121 122 123 124 125 Individual error scores and total error scores (TES), summed across the visible spectrum and purple hues, were determined using the software supplied by the

126 manufacturer. Partial error scores (PES) were used to assess hue discrimination

127 specifically among blue and cyan hues using samples 50 to 68 and 36 to 54

128 respectively and were divided by TES to obtain percentage values (%PES).

129

130 (b) Anomaloscope

131 132 133 134 135 136 137 138 This test was administered using the Moreland match on an HMC MR anomaloscope (type 7700: Oculus, Wetzlar, Germany). This provides a 2 degree field within which 436 and 490 nm sources are matched to a mixture of 480 and 589 nm, the latter mixture providing a brightness match. Control of stimuli and calculation of blue/green mixture were achieved with the anomaloscope under computer control using the manufacturer's software. Neutral pre-adaption was not used as this was found to produce transient adaptation effects on stimulus saturation. Stimuli were presented under continuous viewing mode. Following

practice, subjects toggled the mixture to obtain 4 matches, 2 each with the mixture preset to blue bias and green bias. The mean of 6 blue/green matches 139 140

was calculated for each subject to obtain the midpoint. 141

142

143 (c) Customized short-wavelength automated perimetry (cSWAP)

144 Foveal and parafoveal increment sensitivities were measured using an

145 adaptation of the standard SWAP routine on a Humphrey Field Analyzer 2i (Carl

146 Zeiss Medetec, Jena, Germany). Yellow (530nm) background luminance was

147 100 cd. m^2 . Size V targets of 440 nm and 200msec duration subtending 1.7

148 degrees at the eye were presented at 0, 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 degrees eccentricity

149 from a fixation target. The number of targets at each eccentricity beyond the

150 foveal center varied from 4 to 20. On each presentation, a single target was

151 presented. Increment thresholds were obtained using the SWAP adaptive

152 staircase full thresholding technique. Subjects were given 3 minutes to adapt to

153 the background before testing began. Sensitivity for each eccentricity was the

154 mean of values for all targets in the group at that eccentricity.

155

156 **Macular pigment optical density** (**MPOD)**

157

158 MPOD was measured by customized heterochromatic flicker photometry (cHFP)

159 using a densitometer (Macular Metrics Corp., Providence, RI) which alternates

160 460 and 550 nm stimuli, the former being maximally absorbed by MP while the

161 latter is not absorbed by MP. A spatial profile of MPOD was obtained by

associations between MPOD and (1) short wavelength hue discrimination in the region of peak absorption by MP and (2) discrimination at the short wavelength end of the expected axis of a type III acquired color vision defect were investigated by calculating %PES for color samples 50-68 and 36-54 respectively, i.e. %(PES/TES). An example of this analysis is provided in Figure 2, which is a scattergram of % partial error scores (%PES) for FM100 samples 36-54 against macular pigment optical density (MPOD) at 1.75 0 eccentricity. Despite an apparent trend of increased %PES with higher MPOD, both (1) and (2) were found to be non-significantly correlated (p>.001 with Bonferroni correction) to MPOD at all eccentricities. 185 186 187 188 189 190 191 192 193 194 195 196 197 198 199 200 201 202 The anomaloscope Moreland match midpoints were found to be negatively correlated to MPOD at all eccentricities (see Table 1 and Figure 3), indicating a shift towards green mixtures to match cyan. The coefficient was maximal for MPOD at 1.75⁰, corresponding to the anomaloscope stimulus diameter of 2^0 . MPOD at 1.75⁰ accounted for 23.9% of variability (r²) in Moreland match data. Coefficients were still significant after Bonferroni correction at all eccentricities except at 0.5 degrees.

203 204 205 206 207 cSWAP data (sensitivity in dB) at all eccentricities measured were negatively correlated at high significance levels, with MPOD at both 1.75 and 3 degrees of retinal eccentricity: see Table 1. Figure 4 is a scattergram of the data for cSWAP at 2⁰ and MPOD at 1.75⁰. Furthermore, cSWAP at the fovea correlated negatively and significantly with MPOD at all eccentricities. Thus high cSWAP

sensitivities were associated with low MPOD.However, after Bonferroni 208

correction, only foveal cSWAP correlated significantly with MPOD at 1.75 and 3 209

degrees. The maximal proportion of variability in cSWAP attributable to MPOD 210

 (r^2) is 21.2% (for foveolar cSWAP and MPOD at 1.75⁰). 211

212

213 **DISCUSSION**

214

215 216 217 218 219 220 221 222 223 224 225 Our hue discrimination data do not support the findings of Moreland and Dain (1995) 22 , who found a significant increase in both TES and PES in the bluegreen region with their MP1 carotene filter of 1.0 maximum absorbance. We found no statistically significant association between MPOD at any retinal eccentricity and TES or PES after application of Bonferroni correction. This discrepancy may be a reflection of the nature of Moreland and Dain's filter, which was considerably denser than typical MPOD values; it exceeded the MPOD of all of our subjects at and between 1.75 degrees and the foveola) and did not provide an exact fit to the spectral absorbance of MP. It may also reflect a difference between a physiological filter, to which the visual system has adapted, and a filter placed before the eye.

226

227 228 229 230 It is possible that an artificial filter creates short-term changes in color vision and that an autoregulatory process adjusts retinal and/or cortical color mechanisms on a long-term basis in response to their naturally occurring MPOD. This hypothesis is supported by data showing a consistent shift in achromatic locus

over a 3 month period for cataract patients post-surgery 34 , by color constancy effects for blue and green targets despite crystalline lens brunescence (Hardy et al. 2005), and by evidence of plasticity of adult neural color mechanisms 36 . Rodriguez-Carmona et al. ²⁶ found no correlation between yellow-blue thresholds and MPOD using a technique in which threshold color differences were measured for detection of movement of a stimulus within a checkered array. 231 232 233 234 235 236 237

238 239 240 241 242 243 244 245 246 247 248 We did not assess the association, if any, of MPOD across subjects with color appearance other than by using the HMC anomaloscope Moreland match. Using this technique, we found that midpoint data were surprising in that subjects with high MPOD required less blue to match cyan; this finding was consistent for MPOD at all eccentrities. No directly comparable data exist in the literature, though Stringham and Hammond 17 found that yellow-blue cancellation thresholds were constant across the retina despite significant MPOD variability across the retinal region tested. It is of interest that in one study of Moreland match midpoint data, no difference was reported between post-cataract patients with short wavelengthe-absorbing intra-ocular lenses (IOLs) and those with clear $IOLs³⁷$.

249

250 251 252 253 The cSWAP data show relatively constant sensitivity across the retina beyond the foveola (Figure 5) despite substantial differences in MPOD across the retina (Figure 1). This finding is consistent with that of Stringham et al. 29 who used Maxwellian-view multi-channel optics except that they found slightly lower

sensitivity at the foveola compared to parafovea using 16 subjects of similar age to those in the present study. This suggests that parafoveal (but not foveolar) cSWAP may provide a valid clinical test of SWS cone function. The fact that we found statistically significant inverse correlations between short-wave sensitivity for the foveal stimulus and MPOD at two eccentricities does not in fact contradict Stringham et al.'s conclusions; our correlations relate to differences between subjects rather than to averaged measures across the retina which would not take into account the effects of inter-subject variance in both SWS cone sensitivity and MPOD at any single retinal locus. 254 255 256 257 258 259 260 261 262

263

264 We hypothesize that the fact that SWS cone *sensitivity* exhibited significant

265 inverse associations with MPOD, while hue discrimination *thresholds* showed no

266 significant associations with MPOD, may be related to temporal differences

267 between the 2 measures. It is possible that, by using short stimulus

268 presentations, the cSWAP technique (200 msec) produces transient effects quite

269 different to those found with much longer presentations such as those of the

270 FM100 test.

271

272 273 274 275 276 Confounding variables which might influence the relationship between MPOD and color vision include: iris and choroidal pigmentation, age, stimulus size, and pupil diameter. The effect of iris pigment density has been studied by Woo and Lee (2002)³⁸, who found that Asians have poorer PES in the blue quadrant, and by Hammond and Caruso-Avery (2000) 39 , who reported that subjects with darker

irides had higher MPOD. Since all subjects in the present study were Caucasian, the density range of both iris pigment and choroidal pigment was limited, and yet MPOD was found to correlate significantly with color sensitivity across a variety of measures. We suggest that our findings are independent of iris pigmentation, though such pigmentation is a factor in a less racially homogenous group of subjects⁴⁰. 277 278 279 280 281 282

283

284 285 286 287 288 289 290 291 292 293 294 295 296 297 298 299 The effect of age on hue discrimination, in the blue-green spectral region in particular, is well known⁴¹ and is partly due to wavelength-selective loss of light transmission by the aging crystalline lens 42 . An age effect on MPOD has also been reported, some studies having shown a statistically significant age related decline in MPOD ^{39,43}. It is therefore possible that age is a confounding factor influencing our findings on MPOD and hue discrimination in the blue-green spectral region. A similar age effect is possible in relation to SWS cone function as measured by cSWAP^{44,45}. Although our subjects were restricted to the age range 18 to 40 years, and our exclusion criteria included any evidence of cataract, potentially confounding contributions attributable to age cannot be dismissed. However, inspection of Table 1 shows that first-order partial correlation coefficients with age as the control variable are very similar to zeroorder coefficients. In no case did a significance level change from significant to non-significant by controlling for age. We therefore suggest that our observed associations between MPOD and both Moreland midpoint and cSWAP are independent of age within the age range of the present study (18 to 40 years,

mean age \pm SD = 29 \pm 6 years). However, the age factor may be important in older subjects. 300 301

302

303 304 305 306 307 308 309 310 311 312 313 314 315 Stimulus size and location are known to affect both color vision ⁴⁶ and measures of MPOD 3 . In the present study MPOD was measured using targets subtending between 30 minutes and 3.5 degrees at eccentricities between 0 and 3 degrees. Color thresholds were measured using centrally fixated targets subtending approximately 1.5 degrees (FM100), 2 degrees (anomaloscope), and 1.7 degrees at between 0 and 5^0 eccentricity (cSWAP). A clear pattern is evident from our data: MPOD correlated consistently across size and eccentricity parameters with cSWAP and Moreland midpoint. MPOD values were reported in this study at a range of eccentricities in order to assess the consistency of correlations, and because retinal images extend beyond their geometric optical limits as a result of aberrations, diffraction and scatter. Furthermore eye movements produce translational shift of retinal images in a natural viewing environment.

316

317 318 319 320 321 The practical implications of the present study are two-fold. Firstly, dietary supplementation to increase MPOD is not likely to adversely affect hue discrimination. However, a longitudinal study of the effects of supplementation on color vision is needed to support this. Secondly, we have shown that appropriate customization of a standard clinical automated perimetry test (cSWAP) provides

37. Muftuoglu O, Karel F, Duman R. Effect of a yellow intraocular lens on

scotopic vision, glare disability, and blue color perception. J Cat Refr Surg 2007;33:658-66.

- 38. Woo GC, Lee M. Are ethnic differences in the F-M 100 scores related to macular pigmentation? Clin Exp Optom 2002;85:372-7.
- 39. Hammond and Caruso-Avery. Macular pigment optical density in a Southwestern sample. [Invest Ophthalmol Vis Sci](javascript:AL_get(this,%20) 2000;41:1492-7.
- 40. Dain SJ, Cassimaty VT, Psarakis DT. Differences in FM100-hue test performance related to iris colour may be due to pupil size as well as presumed amounts of macular pigmentation. Clin Exp Optom 2004;87:323-5.
- 41. Roy MS, Podgor MJ, Collier B. Color vision and age in a normal North American population. [Graefe's Arch Clin Exp Ophthalmol](javascript:AL_get(this,%20)1991;229:139- 44.
- 42. Beirne RO, McIlreavy L, Zlatkova MB. The effects of age-related lens yellowing on Farnsworth Munsell 100 hue error score. Ophthal Physiol Opt 2008;28:448-56.
- 43. Nolan JM, Stack J, O'Donovan O, Loane, E, Beatty S. Risk factors for age-related maculopathy are associated with a relative lack of macular pigment. [Exp Eye Res](http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/00144835) 2007:84;61-74.
- 44. Johnson CA, Adams AJ, Twelker JD, Quigg JM. Age-related changes in the central visual field for short-wavelength-sensitive pathways. J Opt Soc Am (A) 1988;5:2131–9.

45. Gardiner SK, Johnson CA, Spry PGD. Normal age-related sensitivity loss

for a variety of visual functions throughout the visual field. Optom Vis Sci 2006;83:438-43.

46. Weitzman DO, Kinney JAS. Effect of stimulus size, duration, and retinal location upon the appearance of color. J Opt Soc Am 1969;59:640-3.

419

420

- 421 **FIGURE 1**
- 422 **Spatial profile of macular pigment optical density (MPOD).** Abscissa:
- 423 424 eccentricity in degrees. Ordinate: mean MPOD across subjects +/- 2 standard deviations.
- 425
- 426 **FIGURE 2**
- 427 **Scattergram of % partial error scores (%PES) for FM100 caps 36-54 against**
- 428 **macular pigment optical density (MPOD) at 1.75⁰ eccentricity. Solid line =**
- 429 linear model least-squares regression (%PES = -0.239*MPOD + 33.92)
- 430
- 431 **FIGURE 3**
- 432 **Scattergram of anomaloscope Moreland match midpoints against macular**
- 433 434 **pigment optical density (MPOD) at 1.75⁰ eccentricity**. Solid line = linear model least-squares regression. (Midpoint = 35.91*MPOD + 61.46)
- 435
- 436 **FIGURE 4**
- 437 **Scattergram of sensitivity data on customized shortwave automated**
- 438 perimetry (cSWAP) at 2⁰ eccentricity against macular pigment optical
- 439 **density (MPOD) at 1.75⁰ eccentricity**. Solid line = linear model least-squares
- 440 regression (cSWAP = -9.67*MPOD + 27.57)
- 441
- 442 **FIGURE 5**
- 443 **cSWAP spatial profile**. Abscissa: eccentricity in degrees. Ordinate: mean
- 444 cSWAP sensitivity in decibels across subjects +/- 2 standard deviations.

TABLE 1.

Correlations between Color Vision Variables and MPOD

 r_0 = Pearson correlation coefficient, $r_1 = 1^{st}$ -order partial correlation coefficient controlling for age

 p_0 = 2-tailed significance for r_0 , df₀ = degrees of freedom for r_0 ,* indicates p<= .05 without Bonferroni correction, ** indicates significant with correction for a 5 by 9 correlation matrix.

MPOD=macular pigment optical density at eccentricities 0.25 to 3⁰, %PES=FM100 percentage partial error scores, B/G 36‐54=blue/green caps (36‐54), B 50‐68=blue caps (50‐68), cSWAP= sensitivity values on customized shortwave automated perimetry at fovea and eccentricities from 1 to 5 0 .