Can Sustainable Tourism Indicators Assist in the management of Sacred Sites

Kevin Griffin
*Technological University Dublin*, kevin.griffin@tudublin.ie

Hadil Faris
*Technological University Dublin*, D11123080@mydit.ie

Follow this and additional works at: https://arrow.tudublin.ie/tfschhmtrep

Part of the Tourism Commons

Recommended Citation

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike 3.0 License
"Can Sustainable Tourism Indicators Assist in the management of Sacred Sites"

Dr. Kevin Griffin
Lecturer in Tourism, Dublin Institute of Technology
&
Chair ATLAS Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage Special Interest Group
Structure of Presentation

A) Pilgrimage, Religion and Tourism – Who is doing what?

B) What do we mean by Sustainability?

C) Applying Broad Categories of Indicators to Religious Tourism
   – Overview of Pilgrims to Dublin IEC2012

D) Conclusion - Are papers in Lecce 2012 considering a broad conceptualisation of Sustainability?
A) Who is Doing What?
The Web
Google Insights (pilgrimage)

Search terms
- Pilgrimage
  - Add term
  - Other comparisons

Limit to
- Web Search
- Worldwide
- 2004 - present
- All Categories

Regional interest

Related terms
- the pilgrimage
- a pilgrimage
- pilgrimage mecca
- mecca
- pilgrimage santiago
- lourdes pilgrimage
- pilgrimage to mecca
- what is pilgrimage
- haj
- haj pilgrimage

View change over time
ngram – Google Books
(Tourism & Pilgrimage)

http://books.google.com/ngrams/
ngram – Google Books

(Tourism & Pilgrimage & Sustainability)
Academic Conferences
Conferences

12 / THE FIRST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON PILGRIMAGE AND RELICS

23 – 26 May 2013

Conference organizers:
Mathieu Bosvert, Université du Québec à Montréal, Canada
Francis Brassard, American College of Management and Technology, Croatia

New Dawn in the Church

New Dawn Walsingham Pilgrimage Conference

Monday 30th July to Saturday 4th August 2012

'A Mighty Wind From Heaven' (Acts 2:2)
Growth of Religious Tourism / Pilgrimage in Academia

What was a niche topic is now a “core” – or is it just trendy (some 2012 Conferences to illustrate):

23-26 May - *The Future of Religious Tourism, Pilgrimage & Spiritual Journeys* (ICOT, Crete)

7-9 June - “Not Losing the ‘Pilgrimage’ in the Pilgrimage Tourism Experience” (ATLAS, Maynooth)

10-12 Sept - “Women, Authority & Leadership in Christianity & Islam” (Roehampton)

27-30 Sept - *Pilgrimage & Sacred Places in Central & Eastern Europe: Place, Politics & Religious Tourism* (Croatia)

26-28 Oct - *Sustainable Religious Tourism* (Lecce)
Broader Academic Analysis
Dear Trinetter,

I have sent to M.F. Affey the content analysis of:
- 531 documents on PILGRIMAGE
- 242 documents on SPIRITUALITY - all aspects, all subjects.

Are you interested by these informations?
Just send me an email.
Best regards.

Mr René BARETJE-KELLER
President
Centre International de Recherches et d'Etudes Touristiques
Emeritus Member of the International Academy for the Study of Tourism
6 Avenue de Grassi
13100 AIX EN PROVENCE (FRANCE)
Tel: 00 (33) (0)4.42.96.99.35
Fax: 00 (33) (0)4.42.23.37.20
URL: http://www.ciret-tourism.com
e-mail: ciret@free.fr
e-mail: domicile/home rbaretje@free.fr
Analysis of 1300 Religious / Spiritual Tourism Documents

With thanks to Centre International de Recherches et d'Etudes Touristiques (International Center for Research & Study on Tourism)

807 research centres / 110 countries / 4,972 individual researchers specialized in tourism & travel (1,500 key-words / 163,284 articles, documents, books)
• Have also Added:
  – Lecce I & Lecce II Papers
  – ICOT Papers
  – Various ATLAS Papers & Special Publications
Authors

http://www.wordle.net
http://tagcrowd.com/
Does this mean Sustainability is Unimportant?
This conference
B) What Do we Mean by Sustainability?
### Dimensions of Sustainability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme / Issue</th>
<th>Indicative subject Material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Triple Bottom Line</strong></td>
<td>Combined economic / environmental / socio-cultural impacts / Philosophical analysis / examination of sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Environmental Sustainability</strong></td>
<td>Physical integrity (biodiversity / condition of wildlife) / Environmental Purity (water / air quality) / Status of protected habitats / protected buildings / Noise / visual impacts / landscapes / Global warming / CO₂ footprint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Socio-Cultural Sustainability</strong></td>
<td>Local folklore and historic sites / Importance and state of local culture (richness) / Tourism impact on local customs/communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Sustainability</strong></td>
<td>Economic impact / Economic competitiveness / viability (leakages / sustainability) / Cost of living / Appropriate level of investment / Tourist spend / Quality / vibrancy of employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resource Management Issues</strong></td>
<td>Carrying capacity / controlling intensity of usage / Resource (water) availability / supply / treatment / Landuse / Transport management / access transport / road congestion &amp; pressure/transport policies / Efficiency of resource usage (water / energy / waste / recycling) / Management of ancillary visitor amenities and services / Maintenance of local distinctiveness / variety of experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sustainable Practices</strong></td>
<td>Environmental management policies and use of best practices at tourism businesses / Adoption of sustainable practices / Sustainability awards and schemes / Eco-labelling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Responsibility</strong></td>
<td>Social equity (gender equity) / Disability access / Workers rights/immigration / Sex Tourism / exploitation of young people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community/Resident Impacts</strong></td>
<td>Local prosperity / Population trends / Community / resident attitudes / satisfaction / Local Access to/use of assets / Community benefits / wellbeing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tourism Businesses/Destination</strong></td>
<td>Tourism partnerships – networks, marketing, cooperation / Appropriate scale of enterprise / Maintaining image / identity / Participation of business in service quality / excellence schemes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Visitor Characteristics and Perceptions</strong></td>
<td>Visitor profile / visitor payback / Visitor satisfaction / fulfilment / Tourist motivation to visit / Tourist expectation re-crowding / Level of repeat business / Tourist perception of local management / Tourist perception of local population / Tourist satisfaction with transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sustainable Management</strong></td>
<td>Community involvement / awareness / control / Integrating tourism into local / regional planning / Assessment of administrative goals / Performance measurement / Clear and capable management of tourism / tourists / Monitoring and maintenance of regulations / performance / policies / Legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Health &amp; Safety</strong></td>
<td>Health / Diseases / epidemics etc / Tourist security / Local / public safety</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Fields of Interest (6)

DIT–ACHIEV Model
Sustainable Tourism

- Heritage
- Community
- Infrastructure
- Visitor
- Enterprise
- Administration
C) Applying Broad Categories of Indicators to Religious Tourism?
A = Administration
• Monopoly Control?
  – Lourdes
  – Mecca

• Pre-Made Organisational Structure
  – Worship Group
  – Orgs / Institutions etc..

Hierarchy / Tour Operator / Pilgrim mis-match

• Professionalism at Sites?
  – Customer Care
  – Management etc...
C = Community
1979
Tourism / Pilgrimage / Place of Worship
H = Heritage
annual trek to a shrine in the Amarnath cave, 3,800 meters (12,800 feet) up in the Himalayas

800,000 visited Toronto 2002 WYD; 7,000 portable toilets. Companies emptied down sewer - but plastic bags & raincoats caused clogs and overflowed – flooded basements of buildings, causing $15 million dollars of damage.
THE TOMB OF ST. LUKE

To protect this ancient church from vandalism and the elements, TEF funded the construction of a new chain-link fence around the site in 2011. The fence will preserve the site until a future consolidation, conservation and partial restoration can commence. The project was done in cooperation with the Austrian non-profit entity Gesellschaft der Freunde von Ephesos, or The Association of the Friends of Ephesus, and the Austrian Archaeological Institute of Vienna.
Management Plans - Skelligs / Clonmacnoise
Stand Firm
OR
Become a Music Festival?
I = Infrastructure
CCTV network to oversee Hajj security
Flooding in Lourdes (2012)

Volume of Pilgrims to the Ganges
E = Enterprise
Failed products

Heritage USA, Fort Mill, South Carolina
Once a thriving Christian-themed amusement park owned by televangelists Jim Bakker
Was 3rd most popular tourist destination in US after Disneyworld and Disneyland - c. 6m visitors.
Employed close to 3000 people, over 2000 acres included hotels, shops, restaurants & water park etc.
V = Visitor
If time allows – Cameo insert

Brief overview of Pilgrims to Dublin IEC2012

In the Roman Catholic church, a Eucharistic Congress is a gathering of clergy, religious, and laity to bear witness to Roman Catholic doctrine.

With thanks to:

Anne Griffin
General Manager
IEC2012 Dublin
## Length of Stay

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>Ireland</th>
<th>Other Overseas</th>
<th>United Kingdom</th>
<th>United States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>None (I am from Ireland)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>91.3%</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-7 nights</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.3%</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>45.2%</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-14 nights</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>76.3%</td>
<td>.8%</td>
<td>52.0%</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>47.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 15 nights</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>.5%</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
<td>21.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>760</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Canadians spent c.€1700 each in Ireland.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Salaries</th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>Ireland</th>
<th>Other Overseas</th>
<th>United Kingdom</th>
<th>United States</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>€20,000 or less</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13.8%</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>30.1%</td>
<td>42.6%</td>
<td>11.6%</td>
<td>16.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€20,001-€30,000</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>17.8%</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
<td>25.9%</td>
<td>20.9%</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€30,001-€40,000</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>16.2%</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>20.9%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€40,001-€50,000</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15.4%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>12.3%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>11.6%</td>
<td>11.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€50,001-€60,000</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.8%</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€60,001-€70,000</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>€70,000 +</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>23.1%</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>16.3%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>Other Overseas</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Less than 3 months beforehand</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.3%</td>
<td>21.2%</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>17.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3-6 months beforehand</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>211</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18.9%</td>
<td>29.7%</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
<td>28.3%</td>
<td>28.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6-12 months beforehand</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24.2%</td>
<td>29.5%</td>
<td>35.3%</td>
<td>44.6%</td>
<td>38.3%</td>
<td>31.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1-2 years beforehand</strong></td>
<td>21</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>22.1%</td>
<td>11.3%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
<td>13.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3-4 years beforehand</strong></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27.4%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>7.8%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Duration of ‘usual’ Pilgrimages

- Day Trip: 21.80%
- Overnight: 2.10%
- 2-3 nights: 13.70%
- 4-6 nights: 26.80%
- 7-10 nights: 27.10%
- 11-15 nights: 7.30%
- 16-30 nights: 2.00%
- More than 30 nights: 0.30%
Satisfaction

- Very Dissatisfied: 8.60%
- Dissatisfied: 2.10%
- Neither Satisfied nor Dissatisfied: 3.80%
- Satisfied: 26.80%
- Very Satisfied: 58.70%
Things they ‘Liked IEC2012’
Conclusion on IEC2000 Visitors – A VERY sustainable tourist

• Very distinct segment
• Know what they want but realistic demands => realistic option
• €€€

• Biggest problems with IEC2012
  – Weather
  – Cost
D) Conclusion - Are papers in Lecce 2012 considering a broad conceptualisation of Sustainability?
DIT-ACHIEV Model of Sustainable Tourism Management

1. Heritage
   - Condition of Key Species
   - Quality of Water Resource
   - Air Quality
   - Status of Protected Habitats
   - Visual quality of Landscape
   - Local Folklore and Historic Sites
   - Importance and State of Local Culture
   - Landscape
   - Archaeology and History
   - Culture

2. Infrastructure
   - Water Supply and Treatment
   - Landuse
   - Road Congestion and Pressure
   - Disability Access
   - Waste Treatment and Recycling
   - Ancillary Visitor Amenities and Services
   - Water
   - Transport
   - Amenities

3. Enterprise
   - Sustainable Practices
   - Water / Waste / Energy Management
   - Connection to Local Community / Environment
   - Interconnectedness with other Local Business
   - Quality / Vibrancy of Tourism Employment
   - Flora & Fauna
   - Water

4. Community
   - Access
   - Involvement
   - Resident Attitudes to Issues
   - Resident Awareness and Attitude re-Tourism
   - Resident Attitude to Quality of Tourism and how it affects them
   - Tourism Impact on Local Customs
   - Population Trends
   - Visitor Profile
   - Tourist Motivation to Visit
   - Tourist Expectation re-Crowding
   - Level of Repeat Business
   - Tourist Perception of Local Management
   - Tourist Satisfaction with Transport
   - Tourist Perception of Local Population
   - Tourist Spend
   - Tourist Spend

5. Visitor
   - Behaviour
   - Volume
   - Tourist Spend

6. Administration
   - Goals
   - Policy
   - Jurisdiction
   - Assessment of Administrative Goals (Environmental, Economic, Social & Administrative)
   - Clear and Capable Management of Tourism
   - Monitoring and Maintenance of Regulations
How do Papers @ Lecce Fulfil the Challenge of a Broad Conceptualisation of Sustainability

Each dot represents the focus of a paper at the Lecce conference – v. subjective categorisation.
Thank you for your Attention